

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Andrew Wright <[REDACTED]>  
**Sent:** Monday, 30 January 2023 4:55 PM  
**To:** IPCN Submissions Mailbox  
**Subject:** Martins Creek Quarry (SSD-6612) Submissions on Additional Material

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Good evening,

Please find herein my comments regarding the additional material supplied in relation to the Martins Creek Quarry proposal.

The letter from Mr Stephen Barry of TfNSW on the 19 Dec 22 advises of a reduction in the proposed haulage rates (Table 1), noting these are lower than the haulage rates agreed with Dungog Shire Council in 2019. Whilst these rates may have been agreed with council, this period of road haulage would be one of many periods that have caused the community distress and the sentiment of the community would indicate that council did not have community support for approving these haulage rates. Based on the community sentiment during this time even the reduced haulage rates are too high.

In his letter, Mr Barry also refers to a strong regional demand for hard rock material. His statement is based on the number of applications for hard rock quarries and not actual forecasts, indeed he acknowledges the demand forecasts are difficult to quantify. The number of applications does not reflect the demand, it merely reflects the level of interest in meeting a shortfall. It is not clear from Table 1 but I expect some parties may have multiple applications in progress, hoping at least one is approved. Again, the influx of applicants reported by Mr Barry does not reflect the demand for material.

Whilst there may be a shortage in current supply, Mr Barry outlines several greenfield development proposals that are underway (Table 2). The commission should consider whether these alternate proposals have more merit than the Martins Creek Quarry. More specifically, **several of the other proposal sites are positioned near state significant roads such as the Pacific Highway and the New England Highway and do not require road haulage through local roads communities and business precincts** such as Paterson village.

Regards,  
Andrew