

DAVID WINTERFLOOD
LAVERSTOCK
N.S.W. 2582
TEL: [REDACTED]

ATTENTION :
THE INDEPENDENT PLANNING
COMMISSION OF NSW
Level 3 , 201 Elizabeth Street
Sydney , NSW , 2000

29/03/2018

SUBMISSION REGARDING:
BANGO WIND FARM PROPOSAL
D502-18

Dear Sirs and Madam .

I have many concerns with the impact of the proposal above hereinafter referred to as the BWF which I will list below :

1. I am concerned about the potential noise impacts upon myself and my habitat .
2. Jason Turner of Sonus Pty Ltd has agreed to send me the lost or discarded raw data background noise for locations surrounding Laverstock being the fine wool producing property near Kangiara and owned by Padang Pastoral Pty Ltd of which I am a Director and shareholder. This sound data has not been forthcoming despite my repeated requests to Kristin Old of CWP the promoter and Jason Turner of Sonus Pty Ltd (Sonus) who has agreed to provide that data after authorization by CWP who paid Sonus for the Sound Report in the initial and subsequent Submissions. I have given clear instructions to both parties as to how the media should be labelled before sending it to my PO Box 4 , YASS , NSW , 2582 , however the data has not been forthcoming. I particularly want the sound data taken from the front of the Laverstock homestead by Sonus

This raw data needs to be held by us as the benchmark to compare it with subsequent sound levels in the event of the CWP Bango towers and turbines going ahead .

I personally will be about 3KM away from the towers and am naturally concerned that the sounds will affect my sleep and therefore my health. We all need to have uninterrupted sleep and there are many findings and medical records available which show that there are definite links between the sound waves generated by turbines disturbing neighbours before and after they are sensitised. The authoritative acoustician Stephen Cooper had highlighted this at the recent AAT hearing which you should be aware of.

I will attach a copy of the findings below as attachment 1 in case you missed it.

I would ask you to read that extract from the final decision.

3.. I am also concerned about the real potential for property devaluation of Laverstock if the BWF installation proceeds. The National Trust Homestead contributes greatly to the property's valuation in both dollar terms and livability for it's scenic and panoramic view especially when combined with the rest of this pristine property. However, that total value would be vastly diminished if BWF proceeds. I graduated with Urban Economics as a part of my Accountancy degree and have undertaken real estate courses and practiced as a real estate agent in NSW so I do know about this subject and its implications more than the BWF and CWP reveal and would have us believe. And I suspect you would agree.

Contd.

I have read the Department's just two examples given in several areas which are not properly disclosed or explained examples and are incomplete without full description . Their development histories are not shown. And the brief details are provided by agents without CWP or the Departments independent verification . We can obtain a Laverstock value before and after BWF valuation if you require. This will assist the Government when they consider calculating the appropriate cash compensation before or after our sale. Your final decision may well force us out of our homes after 55 years if you allow this disgrace to continue.

4. I do not wish to look at 75 wind turbines spinning blades whether I am at my residence or driving around the property or in and out the front ramps and travelling to Yass or Boorowa or elsewhere. I am one of those people who know they are intrusive, noisy , ugly, overwhelming and dangerous to endangered and protected species. They are inefficient and not a cost effective way to generate electricity for the masses .

5. Were it not for the vast Government subsidies and renewable energy certificates industrial wind farms would not exist .

6. There will be extreme noise for me from the blasting and any gravel crushing unless it is done at the Gates to Pat Dwyer's Foxdowns property where a RMS depot and footings have been set up already.

7. Dust can be also be a major carried by the winds from the major excavations necessary to install the very wide permanent roads and pathways required to be set up if BWF proceeds.

8. I am also very concerned with risk of destruction to wild life from blades travelling over 250 KPH at the tip as they strike the protected Superb Parrot , Hawks , Eagles and Bent wing bats which abound here . I have had two bats come into my houses and another seen flying around here .

I have a video of its existence in my hand which I am happy to provide.

9. the traffic disturbance along the Lachlan Valley Way will be extreme as these monster parts are multi wheeled in.

10. The challenge to fighting bush fires in our lightening prone is dangerous and a recent incidence in South West Victoria on the 17th March 2018 when AGL kept the turbines spinning for days until ordered to turn off despite raging fires . More later herein.

11. How can the IPC and NSW Governments Planning and Environment Department determine noise levels and gearbox and turbine blade type and integrity if CWP has NOT disclosed the Brand of Turbine let alone the gearbox type or transmission type ?

The manufactures have different designs , characteristics and performance results . The last thing we want is leaking oil or overheating generators and that happens. They will ben struck by lightening and blades in it's path will be destroyed risking imbalance and tower toppling as happens. Also , the towers tend to rattle in the ground in hard rock even after cabled to the ground . Just ask the famous Bill Quinn and his brother Peter .

12. DECOMMISSIONING : There is no guarantee that the ultimate owners of the BWF machinery and roads and footings will have the funds to remove these monsters. Sale contract contents will be privy and the owners tend be given free rein to do as they please to minimise therir costs and maximize their profitability. The ultimate land owner will end up with the problem and the original landowner will have moved out long ago ultimately leaving an eye sore which no one will be able to restore including the governments at this future time. The Australian landscape will end up resembling Argentina where government and personal corruption has laid barren the once prosperous homes and family's throughout the land . And so Australia will go this way if the destruction continues . It is a grossly uneconomic method for politicians to ingratiate themselves on the world stage for this unmonitored and deluded Paris Climate Agreement.

CONTD.

3.

Australia's population is too small to support the high cost to transfer electricity supply from a cheap reliable source to an unreliable high cost source which will continue to burden governments and consumers with its short and long term committed costs. It simply does not make sense and I will not accept my habitat being destroyed by a hoax and fallacy fueled by corruption at all levels barring the IPC of course !

13. I am also concerned with the effects on water drainage and transfer from the hills when the ground is dug up to lay power lines along a new path . This will damage existent water seepage paths and cause erosion in many areas . The steep slopes will magnify the issue . Associates may not be concerned with this .

With respect from :

DAVID JAMES LINACRE WINTERFLOOD J.P., NTAA

PLEASE SEE ATACHMENTS .

ITEM 1

AAT Decision & Reasons, Waubra Foundation vs ACNC Dec 4, 2017

1. SUMMARY OF THE EFFECT OF THE MEDICAL AND SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE

Excerpts from Pages 141 to 148 of the Decision

468. The propositions which we understand have unanimous support from the relevant experts or are not contested include the following:

- Wind turbines emit sound, some of which is audible, and some of which is inaudible (infrasound);
- There are numerous recorded instances of WTN exceeding 40 dB(A) (which is a recognised threshold for annoyance/sleep disturbance);
- There are also recorded instances of substantial increases in sound at frequencies when particular wind farms are operating compared with those at times when they are shut down;
- If it is present at high enough levels, low frequency sound and even infrasound may be audible;
- WTN is complex, highly variable and has unique characteristics;
- The amount and type of sound emitted by a wind farm at a given time and in a given location is influenced by many variables including topography, temperature, wind speed, the type of wind turbines, the extent to which they are maintained, the number of turbines, and their mode of operation;
- Wind farms potentially operate 24 hours a day, seven days a week;
- There are numerous examples of WTN giving rise to complaints of annoyance from nearby residents, both in Australia and overseas.

469. The propositions which are supported by the preponderance of relevant expert opinion, and which we accept on that basis, include the following:

- A significant proportion of the sound emitted by wind turbines is in the lower frequency range, i.e. below 20 Hz;
- The dB(A) weighting system is not designed to measure that sound, and is not an appropriate way of measuring it;
- The most accurate way of determining the level and type of sound present at a particular location is to measure the sound at that location;
- The best way of accurately measuring WTN at a particular location is through 'raw' unweighted measurements which are not averaged across time and are then subjected to detailed "narrow-band" analysis;
- When it is present, due to its particular characteristics, low frequency noise and infrasound can be greater indoors than outdoors at the same location, and can cause a building to vibrate, resulting in resonance;
- Humans are more sensitive to low frequency sound, and it can therefore cause greater annoyance than higher frequency sound;
- Even if it is not audible, low frequency noise and infrasound may have other effects on the human body, which are not mediated by hearing but also not fully understood. Those effects may include motion-sickness-like symptoms, vertigo, and tinnitus-like symptoms. However, the material before us does not include any study which has explored a possible connection between such symptoms and wind turbine emissions in a particular population.

470. We consider that the evidence justifies the following conclusions:

- The proposition that sound emissions from wind farms directly cause any adverse health effects which could be regarded as a “disease” for the purposes of the ACNC Act is not established;
- Nor, on the current evidence, is there any plausible basis for concluding that wind farm emissions may directly cause any disease;
- However, noise annoyance is a plausible pathway to disease;
- There is an established association between WTN annoyance and adverse health effects (eg. this was established by the Health Canada study);
- There is an established association between noise annoyance and some diseases, including hypertension and cardiovascular disease, possibly mediated in part by disturbed sleep and/or psychological stress/distress;
- There are as yet no comprehensive studies which have combined objective health measurements with actual sound measurements in order to determine for a given population the relationships between the sound emissions of wind turbines, annoyance, and adverse health outcomes. Indeed there is as yet no study which has given rise to a soundly based understanding of the degree to which particular types or levels of wind turbine emissions give rise to annoyance, or what levels or types of emissions are associated with what level of annoyance in the population. Because it relied on calculated rather than actual sound measurements, and was limited to the A and C-weighted systems, the Health Canada study did not do this.

473. The applicant submitted that the evidence in the hearing provided plausible and credible evidence of the kind required. Counsel referred in particular to the effect of noise on sleep and, in particular, in disturbing sleep. It was not contentious that impaired sleep, if sufficiently serious, may result in a number of ailments and diseases. Professor Wittert said that “depression and sleep disturbance are, respectively, the first and third most common psychological reasons for patient encounters in general practice”. The professor went on to say that insomnia doubles the risk of future development of depression and that insomnia symptoms together with shortened sleep are associated with hypertension. Professor Wittert also said that a person suffering from restricted sleep is exposed to an increased risk of elevated blood sugar levels and endocrine disorders such as diabetes, symptomatic ischaemic heart disease, hypertension, obesity, insomnia and anxiety related illnesses.

476. As our earlier findings have indicated, some wind farms generate sound which is capable of causing, and does cause, annoyance. We are further satisfied that annoyance of the kind which is generated (often associated with psychological distress and sleep disturbance), is a recognised pathway to a range of adverse health outcomes, including hypertension and cardiovascular disease.

481. It follows in our view that the applicant has established that there is a plausible basis for thinking that wind turbine sound (mediated by annoyance) may lead to adverse health outcomes, such as to warrant further investigation. It is unnecessary for us to draw conclusions as to the precise nature of the annoyance which is caused, and whether annoyance may be caused by sound which is not audible (infrasound). That is something which we expect will be the subject of further study and investigation. For our purposes, it is sufficient that annoyance is produced, and it appears that it may be associated with

CONTD.

adverse health outcomes. An identification of the causes of that annoyance may allow it to be reduced or mitigated and adverse health outcomes to be reduced or avoided.

482. We regard it as particularly significant that the NHMRC has considered that, despite the absence of direct evidence that exposure to wind farm noise affects physical or mental health, and the poor quality direct evidence that wind farm noise is associated with annoyance or sleep disturbance, it is appropriate to provide funding to the extent of \$3.3 million for an evaluation of the “sleep and physiological disturbance characteristics of wind farm noise compared to traffic noise” and for an investigation of whether “exposure to infrasound causes health problems”. Given this degree of recognition by the NHMRC, we do not consider that it should be held that the associations which are the subject of the applicant’s activities do not have plausibility or credibility, although not as yet positively established.

485. Given our finding that there is a plausible basis for considering that wind farm sound emissions may have an adverse effect on human health, we accept that conducting, supporting and advocating for further research or engaging in awareness raising activities could be properly characterised as activities promoting the prevention or control of diseases (in the sense of that term explained earlier).

THE ABOVE REFERENCE IS :

<http://waubrafoundation.org.au/resources/aat-decision-reasons-waubra-foundation-vs-acnc-dec-4-2017/>

2. GENERALLY

Please note that if I believed that installing BWF would save the planet earth and its human beings from global warming or climate change at it is now called instead , I would have some greater consideration and guilt for stopping this ridiculous scenario. The climate change hoax initiated by Al Gore and others years ago cannot be proven and statistics prove otherwise. More people have died from the cold than heat in mankind’s history. The sun is our critical source of heat and controls our weather together with the sea and wind patterns. Our egos may say otherwise. I take great interest in both views as I hope you all do. I realise you have goals and plans to adhere to but ask that you do not destroy my habitat in the process .

China is committed to build about 150 state of the art Ultra-supercritical coal power plants. Only 10% in China and 90 % in Pakistan , Vietnam and Thailand and other countries.

Dr. Wu Wenyuan holds a Ph.D. in International Studies from the University of Miami and is an independent researcher based in Miami, Florida, USA who writes that “This technology is also expected to help plants meet stricter standards. These plants ignite coal at a much higher temperature (1400 degrees F) and higher internal pressure levels (more than 5,000 pounds per square inch) than traditional subcritical plants, which allows them to generate electricity more efficiently. According to a recent report by the Center for American Progress (CAP), Beijing has made far more strides than Washington on this front, as more than 90 percent of China’s 100 most efficient coal plants are equipped with ultra-supercritical technologies, compared with only 0.76 percent in the United States.”

My source appears below :

<https://thediplomat.com/2017/07/chinas-clean-coal-power-viable-model-or-cautionary-tale/>

7.

3. TURBINE BLADE POLLUTION

Another concern of mine is the cost and difficulty of disposing of and stockpiling of the vast numbers of turbine blades which have to be replaced each year . Recycling is difficult , expensive and toxic and dangerous to the people who have to cut them up as has happened in South Australia .

4. TURBINE BLADE MATERIAL AND MANUFACTURE

My understanding of current manufacturing of turbine blades is that they are hand made in the main after laying down multilayers of fibre glass and resin . The fumes released are also toxic and cheap labour are often not protected with masks. Even in America. The buildup of retired and worn and damaged blades is becoming a massive problem . The current replacement process of all the blades from the huge English off shore wind farm will take years and cost millions to complete. This is now necessary from rain damage after just five years. The leading edges require a 3mm rubber strip to protect against rain drops striking blades at over 250 KPH over those five years.

5. FIRE RISK IN OUR BUFFALOW AND KANGIARA HILLS

I have attended fires in both the above hills which are common every year in the summer . Iron lode exists in the rock which attracts lightening which triggers the fire . Wind turbines create extra turbulence which fan fires and prevent aircraft from delivering water at the most intense and inaccessible sites. RFS firefighting aircraft will not go near wind turbines whether they are spinning or not. They are more dangerous when the blades are spinning and Annie's Gardner merino stud owner's account told me AGL's attitude to keep the blades spinning until they are forced to shut them down by the RFS even when the fires are raging.

That was a real life Wind farm region incident at Macarthur WF in Victoria and I will do all I can to stop the our environment being made further unsafe by the introduction of the BWF despite the proponents , associates and CWP wishing to receive huge subsidies and renewable energy certificates which create more Government Debt and electricity consumer's price hikes whilst the majority profits ultimately go overseas to the foreign companies and multinationals like AGL and Origin Energy . This is not good economics or financial management and I suspect the Commissioners are aware of this.

6. MY BACKGROUND

I have a B.A. (Accountancy) at the CCAE in Canberra, and attended accounting , auditing and taxation matters with Touch Ross in Canberra and Price Waterhouse in Melbourne. I studied Law at the UTSC Sydney and rebuilt a car with the help of G.M. I have been practicing as an accountant for many years however full research on the threats to our property and values from the BWF have distracted me from other important tasks at hand towards this matter which has been going on for many years.

I consider that I know more about the false economics of renewable energy, the workings of the system and the machines that maintain our current system reliably as well as the unreliable systems which depend on the former as all link into the largest machine in the world . Our East Coast Grid .